

SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION



URAC

CITY of THE DALLES

313 COURT STREET

THE DALLES, OREGON 97058

(541) 296-5481 ext. 1125
PLANNING DEPARTMENT

MEMORANDUM

City of The Dalles
City Planning Department

To: Urban Renewal Advisory Committee

From: Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner & Historic Landmarks
Commission Coordinator

Cc: Nolan Young, City Manager

Date: September 15, 2014

Re: HLC Public Hearing Regarding Urban Renewal Grant Request

On August 27, 2014, the Historic Landmarks Commission conducted a public hearing for the United Church of Christ Congregational's request to replace and/or repair 40 windows in both the historic and non-historic portions of their landmarked church. The application was approved with a 4 to 1 vote. (Draft meeting minutes attached.)

The City of The Dalles Historic Landmarks Commission is, and has been, a Certified Local Government (CLG) for 21 years. The CLG program is designed to promote historic preservation at the local level. Exterior alterations to historic structures are required to follow the Secretary of Interior Standards. However, local review also affords the Historic Landmarks Commission some flexibility allowing the Commission to make determinations based upon the Standards and the information provided in the application.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

AUGUST 27, 2014

City Hall Council Chambers
313 Court Street
The Dalles, OR 97058
Conducted in a handicap accessible room.
4:00 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Gleason called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Eric Gleason, Bob McNary, Pat Smith, Dennis Davis, Sandy Bisset

Others Present: Councilor at Large Carolyn Wood

Staff Present: Senior Planner Dawn Marie Hert, City Attorney Gene Parker, Administrative Secretary Carole Trautman

AGENDA

It was moved by Smith and seconded by Bissett to approve the agenda as submitted. The motion carried unanimously.

MINUTES

It was moved by McNary and seconded by Smith to approve the June 25, 2014 minutes as submitted. The motion carried unanimously.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None

PUBLIC HEARING

Historic Landmarks Commission Application #145-14 – United Church of Christ Congregational; Request: Approval for the restoration and remodel Phase II project to replace 40 additional windows in both the original historic portion of the building as well as the addition. Property is located at 111 East 5th Street, The Dalles, Oregon, and is further described as Township 1 North, Range 13 East, Map 3 BC, tax lot 6700. Property is zoned "CBC" – Central Business Commercial District. The historic name of the structure is The Congregational United Church. The structure was built in 1936 and is classified as Secondary/Significant in the Commercial Historic District, Inventory #9.

Chair Gleason read the public hearing rules and asked if any of the Commissioners had a conflict of interest, ex parte contact or bias that would prohibit them from making an impartial decision on the application. Gleason

reported that he was at the site earlier in the day and had a conversation with one of the applicants. He stated there was no discussion regarding the application.

Gleason asked if any of the audience members wished to challenge the qualifications of the Commissioners. None were noted.

Chair Gleason opened the public hearing at 4:06 PM.

Senior Planner Hert highlighted the staff report and noted that a correction was needed on page 2, Finding #A-2. Hert referenced the Commodore II building and the IOOF building. The American Legion building should have been referenced rather than the IOOF building. In closing, Hert highlighted the three proposed conditions of approval. Gleason stated that under condition of approval #3, the word "doors" should be removed.

Upon Chair Gleason's request, Senior Planner Hert read through all of the Findings of Fact in the staff report.

Commissioner McNary stated there were no standards on replacing the metal windows. Gleason said the Commission was to follow the Secretary of Interior standards. Gleason indicated that he had issues with the conclusions, but he would deal with those later. Senior Planner Hert stated that these issues had been addressed in the previous hearings for Phase I of the project, and the Phase II modifications were for the newer portion of the building. She stated that she should have had the applicant present the entire scope of work at once. Hert advised that the Commission had made a previous determination on the Phase I project, and she believed this request had a smaller historic impact than the first request.

Testimony

Proponents

Pastor Deborah Allen, 1809 Montana Street, The Dalles, Oregon, stated this project was focused on the secondary addition built in the 1950s. The addition was used for a pre-school, Habitat for Humanity offices, Boy Scout meetings, Sunday School classes, and church offices. The windows were single paned, steel rimmed, and there was a substantial amount of surface area. The purpose of the project was, once again, to increase the energy efficiency of the building. Ms. Allen said there was a small portion in the older building, the rounded area, where a couple of windows would be replaced as well. She said all windows would be replaced except for the stained glass windows. Gleason asked what material was used in the large peaked window that faced 5th Street that had slats. Ms. Allen said they were blinds made of micro-aluminum, and she assumed they were original to the building.

Chair Gleason asked if they had explored other options other than replacement such as retrofitting storm windows. Ms. Allen said they had not.

Nikki Lesich, 1814 East 14th Street, The Dalles, Oregon, clarified that the large peaked window Chair Gleason referenced would be modified so that the upper part (marked with an "X" in the picture) would not be worked on. Only the bottom portion of the windows would be replaced. Ms. Lesich advised that the windows on the last three pages of pictures were located in the addition, and they were not historical. She asked the Commission to focus on the window replacements for the newer structure since the Commission had previously reviewed and made a determination on the historic portion of the structure.

Chair Gleason asked window contractor, Joe Howell, 616 East 3rd Street, The Dalles, Oregon, if the seven windows listed as the Isabella Gray Room and the six windows in the Fireside Room were wood windows. Mr. Howell said they were wood; they would be double hung as in the Phase I project. He said it was no longer possible to get the same type of windows as the existing windows. The new double hung windows would match the other windows on the building. Gleason asked if they would look the same from the exterior. Mr. Howell said

they would look the same, but they would operate up and down rather than pop out. He said once the windows were all in place, it would be very difficult to see a difference. Mr. Howell stated that the replacement vinyl windows were going to be a dark almond color to integrate with the existing windows, and they would be much more energy efficient.

Randy Stewart, 4280 Pleasant Hill Ridge Road, The Dalles, Oregon, thanked the Commission for approving their Phase I project. He stated the church had raised a lot of money for many repairs to the building, and they were intent on preserving the building. He requested approval for the Phase II project.

Opponents

None

Chair Gleason closed the public hearing at 4:31 PM.

Deliberation

Gleason stated he had reservations towards the project, as in the first project. He felt the staff report was inaccurate and cited Secretary Standard #2 that stated alterations to features and spaces that characterize property "shall be avoided." Gleason said the scope of work was to replace the windows. Standard #5, Gleason said, called for preservation of craftsmanship. He said the Commission was being asked to replace features with things that were not only mechanically different, but also visually different. That was not consistent with what the Commission's decisions had been in the past, Gleason said. Referring to Standard #6, he stated that features were to be repaired, not replaced, and these windows were being replaced. He said he understood the Commission, as a Certified Local Government, was allowed to "bend the rules" to fit local conditions, but he doubted the applicant had made a case that the windows needed replacing. Chair Gleason distributed a publication of three preservation briefs from the U.S. Department of the Interior (Attachment 1) and a handout of some photographs of windows currently being worked on (Attachment 2).

Senior Planner Hert advised Chair Gleason that he was providing additional information to the Commission after the public hearing was closed which would not allow an opportunity for the applicant to respond to the additional information.

McNary stated there would be replacement parts regardless, and he was sure the windows used for replacement have met the State Historic Preservation Office's (SHPO) requirements. Senior Planner Hert confirmed that the Marvin Tilt windows met SHPO requirements. Gleason said he had not been convinced that replacement was the only option available.

Senior Planner Hert reminded the Commission that the State Historic Preservation Office did not have a list of qualified individuals that could determine whether or not the windows were repairable. She said that, as a Certified Local Government, the Commission could vary the standard and make decisions at a local level.

After further discussion, it was moved by McNary and seconded by Davis to approve HLC application #145-14, United Church of Christ Congregational, to include the three Conditions of Approval as amended. McNary, Smith, Davis and Bisset voted in favor, Gleason opposed; the motion carried.

RESOLUTION

It was moved by Davis and seconded by Smith that staff prepare HLC Resolution #135-14 for HLC application #145-14, United Church of Christ Congregational, based upon staff's report and findings of fact and to include the three conditions of approval as amended on record. McNary, Smith, Davis and Bisset voted in favor, Gleason opposed. The motion carried.

PIONEER CEMETERY

Senior Planner Hert reported that the cemetery was due for maintenance. Also, she would contact Sallie Donovan regarding the monument headstone class.

McNary reported that the wire fencing fell down. Senior Planner Hert said she would contact the City Maintenance Crew. McNary asked for information on the ownership of the picket fence. Hert said she would look into it.

McNary asked for a status report on the easement. Hert indicated City Councilor Spatz was working on it, and she would check on the status.

Senior Planner Hert advised that the Rock Fort monument repair was completed. Councilor Wood reminded Hert that funds were available through the Oregon Trails Funds for state and national trail signs.

STAFF/COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Senior Planner Hert gave an update on the directional interpretive signage. There had been a delay in the production of the blades for the directional sign due staffing issues at the sign company. She anticipated the blades would be produced and installed soon. Hert also reported that she had not heard from the Tribes regarding their sign panel. Councilor Wood said the tribal representative had been extremely busy.

Pat Smith exited the meeting at 5:15 PM.

Commissioner Bisset handed out newly produced historic brochures. Approximately 5,000 were printed, and many people had offered to help fund future printings. Bisset reported that the purpose for this historic brochure differed from the Walking Tour brochure.

Chair Gleason brought attention to the pictures he took of the workmanship of the window replacement at the United Church of Christ Congregational and stated that the church did not replace the windows in kind. Senior Planner Hert said fire life safety could have superseded historic guidelines. Commissioner Davis stated that if there were fire safety requirements, it should have come back to the Commission in this application. Hert said she would talk to Ms. Lesich to see if there were any modification requirements.

Commissioner McNary asked for the status on the historic plaques. Hert said she would try to get funds for one or two plaques a year. McNary mentioned that Pulpit Rock had no plaque.

Commissioner Davis asked if there was progress on getting a directional sign for the Fire Museum. Administrative Secretary Trautman reported that City Hall had a policy that its Fire Museum sign was to only be displayed when Fire District personnel were available at the museum to conduct tours and answer questions. Staff will pursue a resolution further.

NEXT MEETING – September 24, 2014

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Gleason adjourned the meeting at 5:28 PM.

Respectfully submitted by Administrative Secretary Carole Trautman

Eric Gleason, Chairman